

Committee Substitute for  
House Joint Resolution No. 7111

A joint resolution proposing a revision of Article V of the State Constitution, relating to the judiciary, consisting of amendments to Sections 2, 11, and 12 of Article V of the State Constitution; revising provisions relating to repeal of court rules; limiting readoption of a repealed court rule; providing for Senate confirmation of Supreme Court justices; requiring the Judicial Qualifications Commission to make all of its files available to the Speaker of the House of Representatives; providing for confidentiality of records provided to the House of Representatives until impeachment is initiated; making other conforming and modernizing changes to the State Constitution regarding the judicial branch.

Be It Resolved by the Legislature of the State of Florida:

That the following revision to Sections 2, 11, and 12 of Article V of the State Constitution is agreed to and shall be submitted to the electors of this state for approval or rejection at the next general election or at an earlier special election specifically authorized by law for that purpose:

ARTICLE V

JUDICIARY

SECTION 2. Administration; practice and procedure.—

(a) The supreme court shall adopt rules for the practice and procedure in all courts including the time for seeking appellate review, the administrative supervision of all courts, the transfer to the court having jurisdiction of any proceeding when the jurisdiction of another court has been improvidently invoked, and a requirement that no cause shall be dismissed because an improper remedy has been sought. The supreme court shall adopt rules to allow ~~it the court~~ and the district courts of appeal to submit questions relating to military law to the federal Court of Appeals for the Armed Forces for an advisory opinion. Rules of court may be repealed by general law that expresses the policy behind the repeal enacted by two-thirds vote of the membership of each house of the legislature. The court may readopt the repealed rule only in conformity with the public policy expressed by the legislature. If the legislature determines that a rule has been readopted and repeals the readopted rule, the rule may not be readopted thereafter without prior approval of the legislature.

(b) The chief justice of the supreme court shall be chosen by a majority of the members of the court; shall be the chief administrative officer of the judicial system; and shall have the power to assign justices or judges, including consenting retired justices or judges, to temporary duty in any court for which the judge is qualified and to delegate to a chief judge of a judicial circuit the power to assign judges for duty in that circuit.

(c) A chief judge for each district court of appeal shall be chosen by a majority of the judges thereof or, if there is no majority, by the chief justice. The chief judge shall be responsible for the administrative supervision of the court.

(d) A chief judge in each circuit shall be chosen from among the circuit judges as provided by supreme court rule. The chief judge of a circuit shall be responsible for the administrative supervision of the circuit courts and county courts in the ~~his~~ circuit.

#### SECTION 11. Vacancies.—

(a) Whenever a vacancy occurs in a judicial office to which election for retention applies, the governor shall fill the vacancy by appointing for a term ending on the first Tuesday after the first Monday in January of the year following the next general election occurring at least one year after the date of appointment, one of not fewer than three persons nor more than six persons nominated by the appropriate judicial nominating commission.

(b) The governor shall fill each vacancy on a circuit court or on a county court, wherein the judges are elected by a majority vote of the electors, by appointing for a term ending on the first Tuesday after the first Monday in January of the year following the next primary and general election occurring at least one year after the date of appointment, one of not fewer than three persons nor more than six persons nominated by the appropriate judicial nominating commission. An election shall be held to fill that judicial office for the term of the office beginning at the end of the appointed term.

(c) The nominations shall be made within thirty days from the occurrence of a vacancy unless the period is extended by the governor for a time not to exceed thirty days. The governor shall make the appointment within sixty days after the nominations have been certified to the governor.

(d) Each appointment of a justice of the supreme court is subject to confirmation by the senate. The senate may sit for the purpose of confirmation regardless of whether the house of representatives is in session or not. If the senate fails to vote on the appointment of a justice within 90 days, the justice shall be deemed confirmed. If the senate votes to not confirm the appointment, the supreme court judicial nominating commission shall reconvene as though a new vacancy had occurred but may not renominate any person whose prior appointment to fill the same vacancy was not confirmed by the senate. The appointment of a justice is effective upon confirmation by the senate.

~~(e)~~(d) There shall be a separate judicial nominating commission as provided by general law for the supreme court, one ~~for~~ each district court of appeal, and one ~~for~~ each judicial circuit for all trial courts within the circuit. Uniform rules of procedure shall be established by the judicial nominating commissions at each level of the court system. Such rules, or any part thereof, may be repealed by general law ~~enacted by a majority vote of the~~

membership of each house of the legislature, or by the supreme court, five justices concurring. Except for deliberations of the judicial nominating commissions, the proceedings of the commissions and their records shall be open to the public.

SECTION 12. Discipline; removal and retirement.—

(a) JUDICIAL QUALIFICATIONS COMMISSION.—A judicial qualifications commission is created.

(1) There shall be a judicial qualifications commission vested with jurisdiction to investigate and recommend to the Supreme Court of Florida the removal from office of any justice or judge whose conduct, during term of office or otherwise, ~~occurring on or after November 1, 1966, (without regard to the effective date of this section)~~ demonstrates a present unfitness to hold office, and to investigate and recommend the discipline of a justice or judge whose conduct, during term of office or otherwise ~~occurring on or after November 1, 1966 (without regard to the effective date of this section)~~, warrants such discipline. For purposes of this section, discipline is defined as any or all of the following: reprimand, fine, suspension with or without pay, or lawyer discipline. The commission shall have jurisdiction over justices and judges regarding allegations that misconduct occurred before or during service as a justice or judge if a complaint is made no later than one year following service as a justice or judge. The commission shall have jurisdiction regarding allegations of incapacity during service as a justice or judge. The commission shall be composed of:

- a. Two judges of district courts of appeal selected by the judges of those courts, two circuit judges selected by the judges of the circuit courts and two judges of county courts selected by the judges of those courts;
- b. Four electors who reside in the state, who are members of the bar of Florida, and who shall be chosen by the governing body of the bar of Florida; and
- c. Five electors who reside in the state, who have never held judicial office or been members of the bar of Florida, and who shall be appointed by the governor.

(2) The members of the judicial qualifications commission shall serve staggered terms, not to exceed six years, as prescribed by general law. No member of the commission except a judge shall be eligible for state judicial office while acting as a member of the commission and for a period of two years thereafter. No member of the commission shall hold office in a political party or participate in any campaign for judicial office or hold public office; provided that a judge may campaign for judicial office and hold that office. The commission shall elect one of its members as its chairperson.

(3) Members of the judicial qualifications commission not subject to impeachment shall be subject to removal from the commission pursuant to the provisions of Article IV, Section 7, Florida Constitution.

(4) The commission shall adopt rules regulating its proceedings, the filling of vacancies by the appointing authorities, the disqualification of members, the rotation of members between the panels, and the temporary replacement of disqualified or incapacitated members. The commission's rules, or any part thereof, may be repealed by general law enacted by a ~~majority vote of the membership of each house of the legislature~~, or by the supreme court, five justices concurring. The commission shall have power to issue subpoenas. Until formal charges against a justice or judge are filed by the investigative panel with the clerk of the supreme court of Florida all proceedings by or before the commission shall be confidential; provided, however, upon a finding of probable cause and the filing by the investigative panel with said clerk of such formal charges against a justice or judge such charges and all further proceedings before the commission shall be public.

(5) The commission shall have access to all information from all executive, legislative and judicial agencies, including grand juries, subject to the rules of the commission. At any time, on request of the speaker of the house of representatives ~~or the governor~~, the commission shall make available to the house of representatives all information in the possession of the commission, which information shall remain confidential during any investigation and until such information is used in the pursuit for use in consideration of impeachment or suspension, respectively.

(b) PANELS.—The commission shall be divided into an investigative panel and a hearing panel as established by rule of the commission. The investigative panel is vested with the jurisdiction to receive or initiate complaints, conduct investigations, dismiss complaints, and upon a vote of a simple majority of the panel submit formal charges to the hearing panel. The hearing panel is vested with the authority to receive and hear formal charges from the investigative panel and upon a two-thirds vote of the panel recommend to the supreme court the removal of a justice or judge or the involuntary retirement of a justice or judge for any permanent disability that seriously interferes with the performance of judicial duties. Upon a simple majority vote of the membership of the hearing panel, the panel may recommend to the supreme court that the justice or judge be subject to appropriate discipline.

(c) SUPREME COURT.—The supreme court shall receive recommendations from the judicial qualifications commission's hearing panel.

(1) The supreme court may accept, reject, or modify in whole or in part the findings, conclusions, and recommendations of the commission and it may order that the justice or judge be subjected to appropriate discipline, or be removed from office with termination of compensation for willful or persistent failure to perform judicial duties or for other conduct unbecoming a member of the judiciary demonstrating a present unfitness to hold office, or

be involuntarily retired for any permanent disability that seriously interferes with the performance of judicial duties. Malafides, scienter or moral turpitude on the part of a justice or judge shall not be required for removal from office of a justice or judge whose conduct demonstrates a present unfitness to hold office. After the filing of a formal proceeding and upon request of the investigative panel, the supreme court may suspend the justice or judge from office, with or without compensation, pending final determination of the inquiry.

(2) The supreme court may award costs to the prevailing party.

(d) REMOVAL POWER.—The power of removal conferred by this section shall be both alternative and cumulative to the power of impeachment.

(e) PROCEEDINGS INVOLVING SUPREME COURT JUSTICE.—Notwithstanding any of the foregoing provisions of this section, if the person who is the subject of proceedings by the judicial qualifications commission is a justice of the supreme court of Florida all justices of such court automatically shall be disqualified to sit as justices of such court with respect to all proceedings therein concerning such person and the supreme court for such purposes shall be composed of a panel consisting of the seven chief judges of the judicial circuits of the state of Florida most senior in tenure of judicial office as circuit judge. For purposes of determining seniority of such circuit judges in the event there be judges of equal tenure in judicial office as circuit judge the judge or judges from the lower numbered circuit or circuits shall be deemed senior. In the event any such chief circuit judge is under investigation by the judicial qualifications commission or is otherwise disqualified or unable to serve on the panel, the next most senior chief circuit judge or judges shall serve in place of such disqualified or disabled chief circuit judge.

(f) SCHEDULE TO SECTION 12.—

(1) Except to the extent inconsistent with the provisions of this section, all provisions of law and rules of court in force on the effective date of this article shall continue in effect until superseded in the manner authorized by the constitution.

(2) After this section becomes effective and until adopted by rule of the commission consistent with it:

a. The commission shall be divided, as determined by the chairperson, into one investigative panel and one hearing panel to meet the responsibilities set forth in this section.

b. The investigative panel shall be composed of:

- 1. Four judges,
- 2. Two members of the bar of Florida, and
- 3. Three non-lawyers.

c. The hearing panel shall be composed of:

1. Two judges,
2. Two members of the bar of Florida, and
3. Two non-lawyers.

d. Membership on the panels may rotate in a manner determined by the rules of the commission provided that no member shall vote as a member of the investigative and hearing panel on the same proceeding.

e. The commission shall hire separate staff for each panel.

f. The members of the commission shall serve for staggered terms of six years.

~~g. The terms of office of the present members of the judicial qualifications commission shall expire upon the effective date of the amendments to this section approved by the legislature during the regular session of the legislature in 1996 and new members shall be appointed to serve the following staggered terms:~~

~~1. Group I.—The terms of five members, composed of two electors as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)c. of Article V, one member of the bar of Florida as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)b. of Article V, one judge from the district courts of appeal and one circuit judge as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)a. of Article V, shall expire on December 31, 1998.~~

~~2. Group II.—The terms of five members, composed of one elector as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)c. of Article V, two members of the bar of Florida as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)b. of Article V, one circuit judge and one county judge as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)a. of Article V shall expire on December 31, 2000.~~

~~3. Group III.—The terms of five members, composed of two electors as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)c. of Article V, one member of the bar of Florida as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)b., one judge from the district courts of appeal and one county judge as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)a. of Article V, shall expire on December 31, 2002.~~

~~g.h.~~ An appointment to fill a vacancy of the commission shall be for the remainder of the term.

~~h.i.~~ Selection of members by district courts of appeal judges, circuit judges, and county court judges, shall be by no less than a majority of the members voting at the respective courts' conferences. Selection of members by the board of governors of the bar of Florida shall be by no less than a majority of the board.

~~i.j.~~ The commission shall be entitled to recover the costs of investigation and prosecution, in addition to any penalty levied by the supreme court.

~~j.k.~~ The compensation of members and referees shall be the travel expenses or transportation and per diem allowance as provided by general law.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the following statement be placed on the ballot:

CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT

ARTICLE V, SECTIONS 2, 11, AND 12

STATE COURTS.—Proposing a revision of Article V of the State Constitution relating to the judiciary.

The State Constitution authorizes the Supreme Court to adopt rules for the practice and procedure in all courts. The constitution further provides that a rule of court may be repealed by a general law enacted by a two-thirds vote of the membership of each house of the Legislature. This proposed constitutional revision eliminates the requirement that a general law repealing a court rule pass by a two-thirds vote of each house, thereby providing that the Legislature may repeal a rule of court by a general law approved by a majority vote of each house of the Legislature that expresses the policy behind the repeal. The court could readopt the rule in conformity with the public policy expressed by the Legislature, but if the Legislature determines that a rule has been readopted and repeals the readopted rule, this proposed revision prohibits the court from further readopting the repealed rule without the Legislature’s prior approval. Under current law, rules of the judicial nominating commissions and the Judicial Qualifications Commission may be repealed by general law enacted by a majority vote of the membership of each house of the Legislature. Under this proposed revision, a vote to repeal those rules is changed to repeal by general law enacted by a majority vote of the legislators present.

Under current law, the Governor appoints a justice of the Supreme Court from a list of nominees provided by a judicial nominating commission, and appointments by the Governor are not subject to confirmation. This revision requires Senate confirmation of a justice of the Supreme Court before the appointee can take office. If the Senate votes not to confirm the appointment, the judicial nominating commission must reconvene and may not renominate any person whose prior appointment to fill the same vacancy was not confirmed by the Senate. For the purpose of confirmation, the Senate may meet at any time. If the Senate fails to vote on the appointment of a justice within 90 days, the justice will be deemed confirmed and will take office.

The Judicial Qualifications Commission is an independent commission created by the State Constitution to investigate and prosecute before the Florida Supreme Court alleged misconduct by a justice or judge. Currently under the constitution, commission proceedings are confidential until formal charges are filed by the investigative panel of the commission. Once formal

charges are filed, the formal charges and all further proceedings of the commission are public. Currently, the constitution authorizes the House of Representatives to impeach a justice or judge. Further, the Speaker of the House of Representatives may request, and the Judicial Qualifications Commission must make available, all information in the commission’s possession for use in deciding whether to impeach a justice or judge. This proposed revision requires the commission to make all of its files available to the Speaker of the House of Representatives but provides that such files would remain confidential during any investigation by the House of Representatives and until such information is used in the pursuit of an impeachment of a justice or judge. This revision also removes the power of the Governor to request files of the Judicial Qualifications Commission to conform to a prior constitutional change.

This revision also makes technical and clarifying additions and deletions relating to the selection of chief judges of a circuit and relating to the Judicial Qualifications Commission, and makes other nonsubstantive conforming and technical changes in the judicial article of the constitution.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the following statement be placed on the ballot if a court declares the preceding statement defective and the decision of the court is not reversed:

**CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT**

**ARTICLE V, SECTIONS 2, 11, AND 12**

JUDICIARY.—Proposing a revision of the Judiciary Article of the Florida Constitution; revising standards and procedures for legislative repeal of a court rule and the Supreme Court’s readoption of a rule repealed by the Legislature; providing for Senate confirmation of an appointment of a Supreme Court justice; allowing the House of Representatives to review confidential files of the Judicial Qualifications Commission under any circumstances; providing that such files shall remain confidential until the House of Representatives initiates impeachment proceedings; and making other technical, clarifying, and conforming revisions.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the following statement be placed on the ballot if a court declares the preceding statements defective and the decision of the court is not reversed:

**CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT**

**ARTICLE V, SECTIONS 2, 11, AND 12**

STATE COURTS.—Proposing a revision to Article V of the State Constitution relating to the judiciary; changing the authority of the Legislature to repeal a court rule by two-thirds vote of the membership of each house to a simple majority of each house; limiting the Supreme Court’s

ability to readopt a rule repealed by the Legislature; requiring Senate confirmation before a justice may take office; providing that if the Senate does not act within 90 days the nominee is deemed confirmed as a justice; allowing the Senate to meet outside of regular session without having the House of Representatives convene at the same time; deleting outdated references related to the Judicial Qualifications Commission; requiring the Judicial Qualifications Commission to provide the House of Representatives access to records; providing for confidentiality of records provided to the House of Representatives until impeachment is initiated; making conforming and technical changes.

Filed in Office Secretary of State June 21, 2011.